



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 31, 2003

Ms. Maleshia Brown Farmer
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2003-7857

Dear Ms. Farmer:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 190431.

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for the following information: (1) copies of Fort Worth Fire Department tapes of any transmissions between Fort Worth police employee Sean Foley and Lt. Connie Peacock in regards to the 911 call placed by a named individual on June 11 from her home, (2) copies of any and all fire department dispatch recordings associated with that call, (3) any and all fire department call sheets or call logs, (4) copies of fire department policies regarding when fire communication employees can deviate from normal emergency response, and (5) copies of any and all documents related to the investigation into Lt. Peacock's handling of the call, including a memorandum written by Capt. Sam Grief explaining the outcome of the investigation. You note that you have released a "copy of all fire department call logs, transmissions of the tape, the 911 tape, and the Fire Department's policy on processing 911 calls." You claim that the remainder of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code. We understand that the City of Fort Worth is a civil service city under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. Section 143.089 contemplates two different types of personnel files, a file that must be maintained by the city's civil service director or his designee and another file that may be maintained by the city's fire department for its own use. Local Gov't Code § 143.089(a), (g). In cases in which a fire department

investigates a fire fighter's misconduct and takes disciplinary action against the fire fighter, it is required by section 143.089(a)(2) to place all investigatory records relating to the investigation and disciplinary action, including background documents such as complaints, witness statements, and documents of like nature from individuals who were not in a supervisory capacity, in the fire fighter's civil service file maintained under section 143.089(a). *Abbott v. Corpus Christi*, 109 S.W.3d 113, 122 (Tex. App.—Austin 2003, no pet.). All investigatory materials in a case resulting in disciplinary action are “from the employing department” when they are held by or in possession of the department because of its investigation into a fire fighter's misconduct, and the department must forward them to the civil service commission for placement in the civil service personnel file. *Id.* at 120, 122. Such records are subject to release under chapter 552 of the Government Code. *See* Local Gov't Code § 143.089(f); Open Records Decision No. 562 at 6 (1990). However, a document relating to a fire fighter's alleged misconduct may not be placed in his civil service personnel file if there is insufficient evidence to sustain the charge of misconduct. Local Gov't Code § 143.089(b). Likewise, information maintained in a fire department's personnel file pursuant to section 143.089(g) is confidential and must not be released. *City of San Antonio v. Tex. Attorney Gen.*, 851 S.W.2d 946, 949 (Tex. App.—Austin 1993, writ denied).

You state that the submitted information relates to an investigation of the fire lieutenant that did not result in any disciplinary action under chapter 143 and is maintained in the departmental personnel file pursuant to section 143.089(g). Therefore, we find that the submitted information is confidential pursuant to section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

You request that this office issue a previous determination to categorically encompass the types of investigative records that did not result in disciplinary action according to sections 143.051-055 of the Local Government Code as confidential. We decline to issue such a determination at this time. Accordingly, this letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the

governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Debbie K. Lee
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DKL/seg

Ref: ID# 190431

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Deana Boyd
Fort Worth Star-Telegram
P.O. Box 1870
Fort Worth, Texas 76101-1870
(w/o enclosures)